



**Parents and Children Together  
Ready to Work and Career Support Services Project  
Contract #2883**

**Program Improvement  
Research Department**

**September 2016**

## **Contents**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	4
Project Summary.....	4
Purpose of the Evaluation.....	4
Findings .....	5
Grantee Recommendations-Lessons Learned .....	5
Recommendations .....	6
PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION .....	7
Scope of the Evaluation .....	7
METHODOLOGY .....	7
Data Collection and Analysis.....	7
PROJECT OVERVIEW.....	8
Table 1. 2012 Federal Poverty Guidelines for Hawai‘i.....	8
Relevance to OHA Strategic Plan .....	8
Project Design .....	9
Outreach and Recruitment. ....	9
Intake and Assessment (Milestone 1).....	9
• Track IA.....	10
• Track IB.....	10
• Track IIA.....	10
• Track IIB.....	10
Training (Milestone 2A). ....	10
• Track IA.....	10
○ Community resources. ....	11
○ Government and Law.....	11
○ Health.....	11
○ Occupational knowledge. ....	11
○ Consumer economics.....	11
• Track IIA.....	11

○ Values.....	11
○ Life skills.....	11
○ Basic computer literacy.....	11
○ Financial literacy.....	11
○ Job readiness training.....	11
● Track IIB.....	11
Community College/Training Courses (Milestone 2B).....	12
Job Placement (Milestone 3).....	12
Job Monitoring (Milestone 4).....	12
Working with Clients with Multiple Barriers (Additional Service).....	12
Job Retention (Additional Service).....	13
Project Budget.....	13
Table 2. Project Budget FY14-FY15.....	13
Milestone Payment System.....	14
Table 3. Milestone unit rates.....	14
Project Goals.....	15
Table 4. Performance and outcome measurements table with proposed number of participants.....	15
Project Staffing.....	16
PROGRAM RESULTS.....	16
Quantitative Results.....	16
Qualitative Results.....	16
FINDINGS.....	17
Grantee Recommendations-Lessons Learned.....	18
RECOMMENDATIONS.....	19
APPENDIX.....	20
Table 5. Performance Results FY14.....	21
Table 6. Performance Results FY15.....	22

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### ***Project Summary***

The Parents and Children Together (PACT), “ Ready to Work and Career Support Services”, project falls under its Economic Development Center, which is located at Kuhio Park Terrace. PACT was awarded a total of \$500,000 over two years. The overall goal of the project is to promote job retention and advancement.

This career development project provided the following employment training and related support services:

- Preparation for the Competency Based Adult School Diploma (CBASDP), workplace values and expectations training, business literacy training, or community college or job training courses;
- Support for participants to work towards initial job placement and maintaining job retention;
- Job monitoring to support the continued individualized progress of the participant;
- Individualized support for participants with multiple barriers and special needs;

The project provided employment and placement services with one-on-one case management to assist in employment and career advancement and retention.

Recruitment was primarily targeted, but not limited to, the Waimānalo and Papakōlea homesteads on O‘ahu. The target audience was Native Hawaiians who were underemployed or displaced, and at-risk high school students who were academically underprepared to earn a General Equivalency Diploma (GED) or go to college. Participants were required to be at or below 300% of the *Federal Poverty Guidelines* for the State in order to qualify for the project.

### ***Purpose of the Evaluation***

The primary purpose of this summative evaluation is to assess the performance results of contract number 2883 between OHA and PACT. The evaluation is being conducted to determine if the services funded (1) achieved the performance measures as stated in the contract, and (2) what collective impact the activities had on the participants during the time period between July 1, 2013 and June 30, 2015.

The evaluation will provide a framework for improving future grant solicitations that will assist OHA in developing meaningful outputs and outcomes and selecting future grantees that are capable of providing services to help OHA achieve its strategic results.

## ***Findings***

The grantee met or exceeded most of its target outputs and outcomes as summarized below:

- 219 participants completed intake (target was 87);
- 106 participants completed job preparation training (target was 87);
- 97 participants obtained employment (target was 85);
- 85 participants maintained employment for at least 90 days (target was 85);
- The average wage of participants at program exit was \$10.75.
- Eighty-one individuals received tuition assistance that led to employment or a higher paying salary.

The following target outputs and outcomes were not completely achieved:

- 9 participants enrolled in attaining 2-year degrees at community colleges or universities (target was 10)
- 7 individuals enrolled in GED classes to prepare for GED tests (target was 8)
- 5 individuals earned GED certificate (target was 10)

The reason given for not achieving the targeted number of GED achievement was that the majority of clients did not meet the minimum grade level requirements to enroll into CBASDP classes and PACT did not have the funds to provide tutoring.

Providing tuition support/career pathways services helped clients increase their wages. Clients who received tuition assistance obtained certifications that brought higher paying employment opportunities or promotions. Examples include Commercial Driver's License (CDL), medical assistants and tax preparers. Tuition support also helped clients who were not eligible for financial aid.

Job readiness training helped prepare clients with the following skills: preparing a resume, writing a cover letter and employer thank you letter, job interview preparation, and learning the basic computer skills needed to submit and apply for online job opportunities.

## ***Grantee Recommendations-Lessons Learned***

The contract allows payment of up to \$5,000 for tuition assistance to obtain certification in certain fields. However, to be licensed to work in the State of Hawai'i, many of the vocational certifications require payment in advance to take the licensing test. Upon PACT's request, OHA allowed the payment of the licensing fees prior to the scheduled training.

The use of funds to pay for books, tools, uniforms, equipment, supplies and certification documents was an issue because the original requirement was that funds be used only for tuition. PACT advocated for the use of funds beyond tuition to cover these expenses and OHA approved the change. Making this change allowed clients to overcome barriers to completing their training and find higher paying employment.

Although the Grantee performed well under the milestone payment system, they expressed a preference for a cost reimbursement payment system, which they opined would help in allowing the project to expand to other counties. They have found it difficult to support their operations in smaller communities under a milestone payment system because each county would have to earn enough revenue through milestones to support its operations. There must be a least foundational staffing and operations in place to ensure consistent and appropriate services. The grantee further stated that the challenge under a milestone system is that to ensure milestones are met, staff would have to increase the number of clients they work with by anywhere from 25-50%, which they aren't compensated for, to ensure they meet the milestones. With a cost reimbursement system the project's operations would continue to be supported during periods where milestone achievement was limited. Based on that unpredictability and given the limited resources of non-profit organizations, the cost reimbursement system is more beneficial for grantees.

### ***Recommendations***

1. In future programs, OHA should consider broadening of the *Education/Training Fund* budget line-item to include up-front fees as well as costs of books and supplies necessary for the academic/job training.
2. Based on the need of financial stability for Grantees, revert to using the cost reimbursement system instead of the milestone payment system.

## **PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION**

The primary purpose of this evaluation is to assess the performance results of contract number 2883 between OHA and PACT. The evaluation will determine if the services funded (1) achieved the performance measures as stated in the contract, and (2) what collective impact the activities had on the participants.

The evaluation seeks to answer the following additional questions:

- Were there any lessons learned by the Grantee?
- What impact did tuition support have on participant outcomes?
- Did the milestone payment system have any impact on the level of services provided? If so, what?
- What were the reasons for not hitting the targets in GED achievement?

After presenting the quantitative and qualitative results, findings and recommendations will be presented for consideration regarding how to better implement income-related programs in future grant periods. The evaluation will assist OHA in making decisions regarding the continuation and future funding of this program.

### ***Scope of the Evaluation***

This is a summative evaluation of the Ready to Work and Career Support Services project. This evaluation discusses the achievement of the quantitative measures and the impact on beneficiaries during the time period between July 1, 2013 and June 30, 2015.

## **METHODOLOGY**

This evaluation is built on a review of information collected from program documents including the grant solicitation, program proposal, service contract, quarterly *Grant Assessment*, the Grant Monitor's *On-Site Monitoring Report*, the contract budget, and milestone achievement forms.

### ***Data Collection and Analysis***

Quarterly reports answered questions regarding key activities completed, identified any issues or challenges impacting project implementation, budget expenditures, and progress towards achieving the proposed performance measures.

A review of the program's activities provided an understanding of how the program was structured and implemented and to identify any pitfalls in that program- culminating in a qualitative analysis.

## **PROJECT OVERVIEW**

The Parents and Children Together (PACT), “Ready to Work and Career Support Services” project provided outreach and recruitment, intake and assessment, preparation classes to complete the Competency Based Diploma program, employment training and placement, business literacy training and business start-up support, career service planning, and on-going case management to meet the program’s contractual milestones as discussed in the *Program Goals* section ahead. The project was housed within PACT’s Economic Development Center (EDC) program.

The project provided the employment and placement services with one-on-one case management to assist in employment and career advancement and retention.

Recruitment was primarily targeted, but not limited to, the Waimānalo and Papakōlea homesteads on O‘ahu. The targeted audience was Native Hawaiians who were underemployed or displaced and at-risk high school students who were academically underprepared to earn a General Equivalency Diploma (GED) or go to college. Participants were required to be at or below 300% of the 2012 *Federal Poverty Guidelines* for the State to qualify for the project.

**Table 1. 2012 Federal Poverty Guidelines for Hawai‘i**

---

<b>Persons in Family/Household</b>	<b>Poverty Guideline</b>
1	\$12,680
2	17,410
3	21,960
4	26,510
5	31,060
6	35,610
7	40,160
8	44,710

---

Source: <https://aspe.hhs.gov/2012-poverty-guidelines-federal-register-notice>

### ***Relevance to OHA Strategic Plan***

Pursuant to OHA’s 2010-2018 *Strategic Plan*, this project addresses the strategic priority of *Ho‘okahua Waiwai* (economic self-sufficiency). The priority is that Native Hawaiians will progress towards greater economic self-sufficiency by having choices and a sustainable future. Success in meeting this priority is measured in the short-term by Native Hawaiians’ median family income equaling 92% or greater than the Statewide median family income by 2018 while the long-term goal is for Native Hawaiians’ median family income to be equal to or greater than 100% of the Statewide median family income.

## ***Project Design***

The project design discussed here is stated in the grantee's proposal.

The project consisted of two tracks with seven components designed to support Native Hawaiian clients who would receive one of the following educational/training experiences:

- The Competency Based Adult School curriculum to achieve their Competency Based Adult School Diploma;
- A career pathway road map to obtaining post-secondary education degree or a two-year training program certificate;
- Values, Life Skills, Financial Literacy, Basic Computer, and Job Readiness trainings to prepare for employment; or
- Business Literacy and technical Assistance to prepare the participant for owning and sustaining a business.

One-on-one case coordination/coaching supported the client in transitioning from unemployment, underemployment, and/or education into the workforce for career advancement.

***Outreach and Recruitment.*** The project began with an outreach campaign to present the opportunity to participate in the project. The various methods of promoting the project included press releases, flyers, posters, job fairs, ads on craigslist.com, community meeting presentations, and homestead association meetings.

***Intake and Assessment (Milestone 1).*** An initial intake and assessment of prospective participants was conducted in this phase. The project staff met with participants to gain an understanding of each participant's background, motivation, skills, resources, and needs for an accurate understanding of the participants' overall situation and to build rapport and a one-on-one partnership. The following items were presented and discussed during intake:

- Overview of the project;
- Rules and responsibilities of both parties: expectations, commitment, attendance and performance requirements, etc.;
- Consent forms;
- Client rights;
- Client Complaint Procedures and Appeal process, ensuring the importance of solution-focused approaches;
- Notice of Privacy Practices [HIPAA compliance];
- EDC Forms for information of demographics, residence, and income;

- Education, employment history, experience and marketable skills;
- Resources and barriers to employment; and
- Participant's desires and wishes.

After the assessment, the staff and participant develop a written Individual Service Plan (ISP) to guide the participant on his/her career pathway. They staff and participant also discuss barriers and develop strategies for overcoming those barriers and access help from other service providers if necessary. The assessment portion was designed to determine which of the following tracks the participant would be placed into:

- **Track IA.** This Track was for participants who wished to pursue their Competency Based Adult School Diploma (CBASDP) and had a reading level of the 7<sup>th</sup> grade or above. Those below that level were referred to EDC's tutoring component. The staff met with the participant regularly to go over progress and address any current barriers. When certification was complete the staff worked with the participant on a new ISP to move on to Track IB for post-secondary education, a two-year training program or, seeking gainful employment.
- **Track IB.** This Track was for participants who were unemployed, underemployed, had a high school diploma or equivalent, or associate's degree, or bachelor's degree, with a reading level of at least the 12<sup>th</sup> grade, and wished to further their education. The staff worked with the participant to enroll in a program that aligned with the participant's career assessment and Competency Adult and Student Assessment Systems (CASAS) testing. If the participant's CASAS score was less than a 12<sup>th</sup> grade level, they were referred to the tutoring component.
- **Track IIA.** This Track was for participants who were unemployed or underemployed and wished to obtain employment, the staff assisted the participant in strengthening their resume and interviewing skills, gaining new work skills, and applying for job opportunities.
- **Track IIB.** This Track was for participants who were unemployed or underemployed and wished to start a home business. The staff then enrolled the participant in the business literacy training.

**Training (Milestone 2A).** The training needs of each participant was determined by which track they were enrolled in.

- **Track IA.** Participants were enrolled in the CBASDP which was a six-month life-skills program consisting of five units (36 hours for each unit, which included the unit review and testing). To earn this diploma, participants had to have passed all unit tests with a minimum score of 70%, a competency-based mastery unit, and fulfill one of three career goals: (1) been accepted for post-secondary education or

training; (2) became employed; or (3) had developed or possessed a marketable skill. The purpose of the CBASDP was to support Native Hawaiians to further develop all aspects of their communication skills: reading, writing, listening, and speaking, computation, problem-solving, and interpersonal skills. The curriculum is designed to help students become functionally competent within the following five units:

- **Community resources.** Types of services available in the community and the means to obtain them.
- **Government and Law.** Individual rights and responsibilities through the study of governmental agencies' functions and regulations.
- **Health.** Ensure good mental and physical health for participants and their families.
- **Occupational knowledge.** Basic information and skills to secure employment that supports their individual needs and interests.
- **Consumer economics.** Basic principles of money management and consumer decision-making.
- **Track IIA.** Participants in this Track worked to complete the entire Core Training which covers basic information about workplace values and expectations. The following subjects are included in the core training:
  - **Values.** Understand and identify their own personal, family, and community values which affect their employability and ability to retain employment or run a business.
  - **Life skills.** Break through self-imposed limitations by helping them discover how to manage their daily actions through time management, attitudes, interactions with others, coping skills, and decision-making. Participants also learned workplace norms and ethics, punctuality, professional conduct, and attendance.
  - **Basic computer literacy.** Raise participants' comfort level in knowing the components of computer systems, how to create documents, use e-mails, and navigate the internet.
  - **Financial literacy.** Build personal financial management skills by developing competency in creating a household budget and a savings plan so the participant can learn to live within their means.
  - **Job readiness training.** Raise awareness about what is needed to transition from unemployment or underemployment to successful, unsubsidized employment. Activities include resume writing, job searching, customer service, job interviewing, and dressing for success.
- **Track IIB.** Participants are enrolled in the EDC's *Business Literacy* training, which is meant for participants who do not wish for traditional employment and instead

prefer a business start-up. The *Business Basics* course teaches how to start and manage a business, including accounting, taxes, marketing, writing a business plan, accessing capital, and obtaining any necessary licenses.

**Community College/Training Courses (Milestone 2B).** Participants in Track IB were enrolled in post-secondary education or a short-term certificate training program. The staff and participant review the CASAS results from Milestone 1 and discuss all options and possible career paths. Once identified, the staff and participant set up monthly meetings to follow-up on the participant's progress.

**Job Placement (Milestone 3).** The staff provided employment services to help participants learn how to search for job leads. They collected and monitored job opportunities, maintained a pool of leads, and created a list of job openings that matched the participant's plans. The staff then worked with each participant to evaluate and select jobs appropriate for their specific goal and skill set.

The staff continues with follow-up services and meets with each participant at least once a month to provide continuing support and technical assistance as needed. These meetings also provide an opportunity to discuss any problems that have come up which could undermine the participant's ability to sustain employment.

This milestone is measured by participants being placed in permanent employment for a minimum of 20 hours per week. For a participant who is already employed, the goal is for the participant to obtain 20 additional hours of employment, or a fifty percent increase in their hourly wage without any decrease in the amount of hours worked. Job completion is achieved upon completion of the first day of work.

**Job Monitoring (Milestone 4).** At least once a month the staff and participant meet to develop action steps to further implement the overall plan, which the participant must continue to work towards. These sessions are used to identify any problems that have come up, continue building upon the participant's strengths, and to continue motivating the participant to achieve the identified goals.

**Working with Clients with Multiple Barriers (Additional Service).** The EDC Teacher/Senior Program Specialist (EDCTSPS) met the special needs of participants with multiple barriers by providing individual support. The *Barrier Reduction Plan* (BRP) is a written document created by the participant and the EDCTSPS to reduce the participant's barriers to obtaining and retaining employment. Barriers identified include arranging childcare and reliable transportation; obtaining basic remedial training; understanding basic workplace habits; participating in English as a Second Language (ESL) or CBASD classes; financial literacy; communication skills; computer literacy; or for Tier 2

participants (to be defined in the *milestone payment system* section ahead), participating in substance abuse services. The BRP consists of one or a series of referrals for services to reduce the identified barriers.

**Job Retention (Additional Service).** While this service is not a contractual requirement, the program sought to maximize job placement retention by creating individually tailored plans for each participant. The staff met with the participant and employer separately once a month. The meetings were designed to reinforce the curriculum and the participant’s progress. This milestone was measured by participants being placed in permanent employment for a minimum of 20 hours a week for a minimum of 365 days within a 455-day period from the confirmed job placement date.

**Project Budget**

Pursuant to the executed contract, the total grant award for the program totaled \$500,000 with \$300,000 being awarded for FY14 and \$200,000 being awarded for FY15. Table 2 below shows the budget breakdown by line-item.

**Table 2. Project Budget FY14-FY15**

Categories	FY14	FY15
Personnel - Salaries	\$104,038	\$65,395
Personnel - Payroll Taxes & Assessments	11,964	7,520
Personnel - Fringe Benefits	18,005	11,858
Contractual Services - Administrative	1,205	820
Insurance	1,235	887
Lease/Rental of Space	5,118	5,118
Mileage	2,160	1,505
Postage, Freight & Delivery	189	189
Program Activities - Client Incentives	13,690	4,112
Program Activities - Childcare	1,200	1,200
Publication & Printing	105	105
Repair & Maintenance	1,460	1,460
Staff Training	281	281
Supplies	1,844	1,844
Telecommunications	1,762	1,762
Utilities	3,444	3,444
Education/Training Fund	105,000	75,000
Other - Administrative Costs	27,300	17,500
Total	\$300,000	\$200,000

### **Milestone Payment System**

Payments to the Grantee were based on a milestone system that classified participants in two tiers. The milestones correspond to the previously discussed program activities. The participants were classified as being either tier 1 (hereinafter referred to as “T1”) or tier 2 (hereinafter referred to as “T2”) participants. The difference between the two was that T2 participants required more specialized services and therefore higher fees are paid to the Grantee. To be designated as a T2 participant, the participant must meet two of the following criteria:

- During the last five years, has had health issues which interrupted the ability to obtain or sustain employment (independent verification needed, i.e. doctor’s certificate verifying health condition);
- During the last five years, has had mental health issues which interrupted the ability to obtain or sustain employment (independent verification needed, i.e., doctor’s certificate verifying mental condition);
- During the last five years, has been arrested on serious criminal charges;
- Has a physical disability (with the exception of obvious physical impairments (such as being legally blind, for example), independent verification needed, i.e. doctor’s certificate verifying condition);
- Has a documented history of alcohol and/or substance abuse which has resulted in a loss of employment;
- Currently homeless at the time of intake, not residing in a house or apartment, is automatically designated as being a T2 participant and is not required to meet the criteria.

Due to limited funding, it is not the primary focus of this project to serve participants who possess a severe chronic disability. Therefore, OHA has reserved the right to reject a client’s designation as T2 upon review of the participants’ documentation. Table 3 identifies the fixed unit rates for each participant per milestone.

**Table 3. Milestone unit rates**

<b>Milestone</b>	<b>Tier 1</b>	<b>Tier 2</b>
1: Outreach, Intake, Assessment & ISP	\$450	\$575
2.A: GED and/or Employment Preparation/Job Development	1,100	1,300
2.B.1: Community College/Training Course	5,000	5,000
2.B.2: Monthly Monitoring of Students (\$100/person per month up to \$2,400)	2,400	2,400
3: Job Placement	450	575
4: Job Support	600	725
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$10,000</b>	<b>\$10,575</b>

**Project Goals**

The quantitative goals are measured by the use of performance measures that were stated in the contract’s *Performance Output and Outcome Measurements Table*.

**Table 4. Performance and outcome measurements table with proposed number of participants**

	FY14 Clients		FY15 Clients	
	Tier 1	Tier 2	Tier 1	Tier 2
<b>OUTPUTS</b>				
Number of individuals assessed for career pathway services	52	3	30	2
Number of individuals enrolled in attaining 2-year degrees at Community Colleges or Universities	10	0	0	0
Number of individuals enrolled in attaining short-term (up to 2 years) training certificates at Community Colleges or other educational institutions	30	2	42	2
Number of individuals enrolled in General Educational Development (GED) classes to prepare for GED tests	5	0	3	0
Number of individuals entered Employment Preparation/Job Readiness Training	46	2	27	2
Number of individuals referred to scholarship programs	40	2	42	2
Number of individuals referred to other programs	10	2	10	2
<b>OUTCOMES</b>				
Number of individuals completed Individual Service Plans	52	3	30	2
Number of individuals successfully attending classes every month in pursuing 2-year degrees or short-term training certificates	40	2	42	2
Number of individuals completed 2-year degree	10	0	0	0
Number of individuals earned short-term certificate or training credentials	30	2	42	2
Number of individuals earned GED certificate	5	0	5	0
Number of individuals completed Employment Preparation/Job Readiness Program	46	2	27	2
Number of individual (sic) obtained employment	51	2	30	2
Number of student completers placed in employment who increased their wage/salary after education training completion.				
(a) GED completer	3	0	3	0
(b) 2-year associate degree of accelerated training	7	0	7	0
Number of individuals maintained employment for at least 90 days	51	2	30	2

### ***Project Staffing***

The program organization consists of a Program Director, a Program Supervisor, an EDC Teacher/Senior Program Specialist, a Program Specialist, and an Administrative Assistant.

The Program Director supervises the Program Supervisor and Administrative Assistant, while the Program Supervisor supervised the EDC Teacher/Senior Program Specialist and the Program Specialist.

The Program Director and the Program Supervisor were responsible for the overall planning, implementation, and coordination of the project. The EDC Teacher/Senior Program Specialist provided the CBASD training and one-on-one coaching, technical assistance, and follow-up services for T2 participants, and the Program Specialist provided the Core and Job Readiness trainings and one-on-one coaching, technical assistance, and follow-up services. In addition to providing clerical support, the Administrative Assistant performed data entry and operated the eHana tracking database.

## **PROGRAM RESULTS**

The following *Quantitative Results* section presents the quantitative results reported in FY14 and FY15, and the *Qualitative Results* section further ahead discusses the additional activities incorporated in the program.

### ***Quantitative Results***

Key project results are summarized in the findings section below. A detailed listing comparing the targeted outputs and outcomes to the actual results can be found in the appendix.

In comparing the results from both years, FY14 showed a higher percentage of success in measures relating to the participant enrollment in academic programs (excluding GED classes) than in FY15. Conversely, in FY15, those percentages decreased while measures associated with the participants having earned/completed the academic programs and the number of participants placed in employment increased. This is due to participants completing either portions of the academic curriculum or completing and working towards the earned/completed group of measures.

### ***Qualitative Results***

During the contract period, responses were provided from the Grantee in the *Progress/Activities' Narrative Report* attached to the quarterly *Grant Assessment* that provided first and second-hand information that also identified what issues were encountered, how those issues were resolved, and the program's impact for the program participants as beneficiaries.

The responses that were submitted by the Grantee relaying what responses they received from participants taken from surveys and culminated in an improvement in the well-being of the participants. The Grantee cites four ways that this was demonstrated that are also echoed in reported participant feedback: (1) mentoring and coaching, supporting the participant towards meeting their economic goals; (2) opportunities for participants to earn certificates that improved their employability and/or earning capacity; (3) a safe place, without judgment to accept support and training to improve their financial situation; and (4) understanding and remembering their roots and kuleana as a member of the community.

## **FINDINGS**

The grantee met or exceeded most of its target outputs and outcomes as summarized below:

- 219 participants completed intake (target was 87);
- 106 participants completed job preparation training (target was 87);
- 97 participants obtained employment (target was 85);
- 85 participants maintained employment for at least 90 days (target was 85). The average wage of participants at program exit was \$10.75.

Eighty-one individuals received tuition assistance that led to employment or a higher paying salary.

The following target outputs and outcomes were not completely achieved:

- 9 participants enrolled in attaining 2-year degrees at community colleges or universities (target was 10)
- 7 individuals enrolled in GED classes to prepare for GED tests (target was 8)
- 5 individuals earned GED certificate (target was 10)

The reason given for not achieving the targeted number of GED achievement was that the majority of clients did not meet the minimum grade level requirements to enroll into CBASE classes and PACT did not have the funds to provide tutoring.

Providing tuition support/career pathways services helped clients increase their wages. Clients who received tuition assistance obtained certifications that brought higher paying employment opportunities or promotions. Examples include Commercial Driver's License (CDL), medical assistants and tax preparers. Tuition support also helped clients who were not eligible for financial aid.

Job readiness training helped prepare clients with the following skills: preparing a resume, writing a cover letter and employer thank you letter, job interview preparation, and learning the basic computer skills needed to submit and apply for online job opportunities.

### ***Grantee Recommendations-Lessons Learned***

The contract allows payment of up to \$5,000 for tuition assistance to obtain certification in certain fields, however, to be licensed to work in the State of Hawai‘i, many of the vocational certifications have additional up-front fees for the licensing test. Upon PACT’s request, OHA allowed the payment of the licensing fees prior to the scheduled training.

The use of funds for payment for books, tools, uniforms, equipment, supplies and certification documents was an issue because of the original requirement that funds be used only for tuition. PACT advocated for the use of funds beyond tuition to cover these expenses and OHA approved the change. Making this change allowed clients to overcome barriers to completing their training and find higher paying employment.

Although the Grantee performed well under the milestone payment system, they expressed a preference for a cost reimbursement payment system, which they opined would help in allowing the project to expand to other counties. They have found it difficult to support their operations in smaller communities under a milestone payment system because each county would have to earn enough revenue through milestones to support its operations. There must be a least foundational staffing and operations in place to ensure consistent and appropriate services. The grantee further stated that the challenge under a milestone system is that to ensure milestones are met, staff would have to increase the number of clients they work with by anywhere from 25-50%, which they aren’t compensated for, to ensure they met the milestones. With a cost reimbursement system the project’s operations would continue to be supported during periods where milestone achievement was limited. Based on that unpredictability and given the limited resources of non-profit organizations, the cost reimbursement system is more beneficial for grantees.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. In future programs, OHA should consider broadening of the *Education/Training Fund* budget line-item to include up-front fees as well as costs for books and supplies necessary for the academic/job training.
2. Based on the need of financial stability for Grantees, revert to using the cost reimbursement system instead of the milestone payment system.

## **APPENDIX**

**Table 5. Performance Results FY14**

	Proposed/Actual	
	T1	T2
<b>OUTPUTS</b>		
Number of individuals assessed for career pathway services	52/140 (269%)	3/12 (400%)
Number of individuals enrolled in attaining 4-year degrees at Universities	0/5 (500%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals enrolled in attaining 2-year degrees at Community Colleges or Universities	10/8 (80%)	0/1 (100%)
Number of individuals enrolled in attaining short-term (up to less than 2 years) training certificates at Community Colleges or other educational institutions	30/53 (177%)	2/3 (150%)
Number of individuals enrolled in General Educational Development (GED) classes to prepare for GED tests	5/2 (40%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals entered Employment Preparation/Job Readiness Training	46/140 (304%)	2/12 (600%)
Number of individuals referred to scholarship programs	40/66 (165%)	2/4 (200%)
Number of individuals referred to other programs	10/140 (1,400%)	2/12 (600%)
<b>OUTCOMES</b>		
Number of individuals completed Individual Service Plans	52/1402 (269%)	3/12 (400%)
Number of individuals successfully attending classes every month in pursuing 2-year degrees or short-term training certificates	41/61 (153%)	2/4 (200%)
Number of individuals completed 2-year degree	10/1 (10%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals earned short-term certificate or training credentials	30/3 (10%)	2/1 (50%)
Number of individuals earned GED certificate	5/0 (0%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals completed Employment Preparation/Job Readiness Training	46/23 (50%)	2/6 (300%)
Number of individuals obtained employment	51/24 (47%)	2/6 (300%)
Number of student completers placed in employment who increased their wage/salary after education/training completion. Jobs by:		
(a) GED completed	3/0	0/0
(b) 2-year associate degree of accelerated training	7/0	0/0
Number of individuals maintained employment for at least 90 days	51/14 (27%)	2/4 (200%)

**Table 6. Performance Results FY15**

	Proposed/Actual	
	T1	T2
<b>OUTPUTS</b>		
Number of individuals assessed for career pathway services	66/30 (220%)	1/2 (50%)
Number of individuals enrolled in attaining short-term (up to less than 2 years) training certificates at Community Colleges or other educational institutions	42/33 (79%)	2/2 (100%)
Number of individuals enrolled in General Educational Development (GED) classes to prepare for GED tests	3/5 (167%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals entered Employment Preparation/Job Readiness Training	27/66 (244%)	2/1 (50%)
Number of individuals referred to scholarship programs	42/23 (57%)	2/1 (50%)
Number of individuals referred to other programs	10/23 (230%)	2/0 (0%)
<b>OUTCOMES</b>		
Number of individuals completed Individual Service Plans	30/66 (220%)	2/1 (50%)
Number of individuals successfully attending classes every month in pursuing 2-year degrees or short-term training certificates	42/178 (424%)	2/2 (100%)
Number of individuals completed 2-year degree	0/3 (300%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals earned short-term certificate or training credentials	42/73 (174%)	2/3 (150%)
Number of individuals earned GED certificate	5/5 (100%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals completed Employment Preparation/Job Readiness Training	27/76 (281%)	2/0 (0%)
Number of individual obtained employment	30/62 (207%)	2/1 (50%)
Number of student completers placed in employment who increased their wage/salary after education/training completion.		
(a) GED completed	3/8 (267%)	0/0 (0%) 0/1
(b) 2-year associate degree of accelerated training	7/83 (1,186%)	0/1 (0%)
(c) 4-year degree or others	0/3 (300%)	0/0 (0%)
Number of individuals maintained employment for at least 90 days	30/58 (193%)	2/0 (0%)

In comparing the results from both years, FY14 showed a higher percentage of success in measures relating to participant enrollment in academic programs (excluding GED classes) than in FY15. Conversely, in FY15, those percentages decreased while measures associated with participants having earned/completed the academic programs and the

number of participants placed in employment increased. This is due to participants either completing portions of the academic curriculum or completing and working towards increased employment opportunities, including increased hours worked and hourly pay rates earned.